

Gleason, M. After School Clubs and English Language Learners' Self-Esteem (2008)

This study of an after school program for ELLs focuses on how to improve elementary ELLs' self-esteem. The sample (N=14) was taken from a rural/suburban elementary school where ELLs represent an extremely small portion of the student population. Students from grades K-5th grade attended a weekly after school ESL club for 8 weeks. Methods used to collect data included using a revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, observations, attendance records, questionnaires, and videotapes. Anecdotal evidence indicates that implementing an academic, culturally sensitive after school program that includes parents can help increase ELLs global self-esteem.

AFTER SCHOOL CLUBS AND ELLS SELF-ESTEEM

by

Marilyn Gleason

A Capstone submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Master of Arts in English as a Second Language

Hamline University

Saint Paul, Minnesota

May 2008

Committee:

Dr. Ann Mabbott, Primary Reader

Ms. Anne DeMuth, Secondary Reader

Ms. Mary Tague, Peer Reader

To Mom and Dad
For inspiring within me a never-ending love of learning,
And for all the encouragement and support you have provided me
On my life journey.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I want to thank Kathryn Tollifson for all the support you gave me throughout the process of writing this paper. A special thank you also to my advisors, Dr. Ann Mabbott, Ph.D., Anne DeMuth, and Mary Tague, for all of the time and energy they committed to me during this project.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter One-Introduction	1
Introduction-The Story Behind the Research	1
Purpose of the Research.....	4
Chapter Summary	5
Chapter Two-Literature Review	7
Introduction.....	7
Identity, Self-Esteem and Belonging	8
Language Learning, Identity, and Self-Esteem.....	10
Academics and Self-Esteem	13
Curriculum Research	14
Summary of Curriculum Research Used	17
Chapter Summary	18
Chapter Three-Methodology.....	20
Introduction.....	20
Methodology.....	20
Setting and Participants.....	22
Data Collection Techniques	23
The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale.....	24

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Inventory-a Pilot.....	26
The Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Inventory as Used with Students.....	26
Observations	27
Chapter Summary	29
Chapter Four-Results and Discussion.....	31
Introduction.....	31
Results of RSE Data Collection.....	32
Summary of Observations by Researcher and Adult Volunteers	33
Observations of Group Interactions.....	34
Observations of Individual Interactions.....	35
The Importance of Parent Involvement	38
Results of Student Questionnaires	41
Results of Classroom Teacher Questionnaires	43
Data Collected from Videotape	44
Discussion of Results Related to Self-Esteem.....	46
Discussion of Results Related to the Curriculum	48
Storytelling and Reader's Theater.....	48
Crafts.....	50
Discussion of Results of Implementing Research-Based Curriculum.....	51
Final Discussion.....	52
Chapter Five-Conclusion	56
Reflections and Conclusions on the Research	56

Research Limitations	59
Recommendations for Further Research	60
Conclusion	61
Appendices.....	63
APPENDIX A Explanation of English Language Proficiency Levels	63
APPENDIX B Curriculum Information.....	67
APPENDIX C Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, 3-5	70
APPENDIX D Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale K-2	72
APPENDIX E Weekly Student Questionnaire	74
APPENDIX F Classroom Teacher Questionnaire	76
References.....	78

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Results of Student Comprehension of the Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale- A Trial.....	26
Table 4.1	Scores on the Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale.....	33
Table 4.2	Results of Weekly Student Questionnaires.....	41
Table 4.3	Results of the Final Student Questionnaire.....	42
Table 4.4	Results of the Classroom Teacher Questionnaires.....	43
Table 4.5	Comparison of Observations from the First ELL Club Meeting to the Last ELL Club Meeting	53

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction-The Story Behind the Research

In the fall of 2006, I was hired to be an itinerant ESL (English as a Second Language) teacher working with kindergarten through fifth grade ELLs (English Language Learners) whose English language proficiency (ELP) levels ranged from levels one to five. (see Appendix A). The majority of the students were at ELP levels three and four which means that overall they were competent in social situations with English, however academic English remained a challenge. The students were all mainstreamed the entire day and were part of a city where 96.7% of the residents were Caucasian of European descent (U.S. Census Bureau). The district was considered suburban by the government, but most residents still viewed the city as a small, country town.

I was one of two full-time ESL teachers serving the elementary population. I served a total of 43 students, seeing 36 students for the majority of the year. The rest of the students either moved or did not participate in on-going services due to parental refusal of services. I traveled to four different schools throughout the year with my base of operations at one of the elementary schools. My ESL colleague worked at the site-based program located at a fifth elementary school in the district primarily serving ELLs with ELP levels 1 through 3. This program served newcomers and other residents with a need for more intensive ESL services.

Throughout the year I observed each of the students I worked with in their mainstreamed classrooms, some more than others. Often I used the pull-out method

(Rosell, 2004) of teaching and supported classroom instruction by pre-teaching or reviewing content from the mainstream classrooms. In one school I was able to teach a writing class for ELLs in a sheltered English immersion class (Rosell, 2004) with grades two through five twice a week. I frequently worked with one student at a time or with small groups of ELLs. In January of 2007, I realized that many of the students across the district were voicing to me how much they liked their ESL time. I wondered why. Often students uniformly leaving a mainstream class feel uncomfortable being singled out for special classes. What was it about the ESL classroom or groups that the students were responding to so positively?

I began to listen more closely and realized the students were expressing loneliness, a sense of isolation in the mainstream classroom where they spent most of their time, and a sense of never feeling “good” enough. I heard frequent comments about not understanding their homework. The material was too hard. The writing was too frustrating. There were too many new words. There was no one at home to help. However, when I checked with these same students’ classroom teachers, all but three of them were doing fine in class, achieving passing grades and completing their work in a timely fashion. Then, at the end of January 2007, two fourth grade ELLs approached me. They wondered if I could set up an after school ELL club so they could see the other ELLs and hang out together. Initially, I was skeptical as there were only 13 ELLs getting ESL services in that particular building and they spanned grades kindergarten through fourth grade. The students requesting the club were the two oldest.

That week I spoke with the Hmong bilingual educational assistant with whom I

worked. I shared that the students appeared to be struggling more with poor self-esteem and feelings of isolation than with academics. I asked if she concurred. She did. As we spoke, we brainstormed ways to address these emotional needs that appeared to be negatively affecting students' perception of their academic performance. We decided to take the students' request for an after school ELL club to heart. We approached the school principal and we were given permission to begin an after school club in that building. We determined we would offer an afternoon snack, learning games, arts and crafts, and an accepting atmosphere with no English corrections during club time. My Hmong assistant would lead some Hmong craft projects. We decided to meet once a week for an hour and a half after school for eight weeks.

In the end, the ESL club was a big hit with the children. Thirteen students attended weekly. Some of them were not even served by the ESL program. Eleven of the students were Hmong, one was Cambodian and one was from India. There were four boys and nine girls. After the conclusion of the eight weeks, students asked us repeatedly to continue the program but unfortunately, we were not able to do so.

We informally observed during club times that:

1. Two of the three students who were behind on homework caught up and were performing better in the classroom on a daily basis although they were still periodically missing assignments.
2. Two students from different backgrounds (Indian and Hmong) became friends and were often seen in the halls together.
3. The kindergarten students often spoke about the older students helping them

understand something. For instance, “The big girl with long hair from club helped me find my teacher.”

4. The older ELLs (3rd and 4th graders) sought out responsibilities during the club time. They often walked the younger students to the club space or the bathroom, helped with snack, taught younger kids games, and helped in clean up activities. They helped plan one of the evenings activities.

5. The younger students asked weekly throughout the remainder of the year, “When is club starting again? Can we come to club tonight?”

We considered the club a great success but we had no documentation to show that it did indeed improve students' sense of belonging or self-esteem or impacted their academic performance. Did this club really have a positive impact on these students or was it just our perception? Did attending the club improve their improve their academic learning? Did they feel more comfortable because they had made new friends? Thus this project was born.

The Purpose for this Research

The purpose of this formal study was to answer these questions: 1) Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? 2) What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students are successful in promoting students' self-esteem? 3) What activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to themselves personally?

School districts try to meet the needs of their ELLs. This project looks at one area often overshadowed by more academic concerns when researchers examine

elementary ELLs. The focus of research related to academics and self-esteem typically addresses middle or high school students (Chavira & Phinney, 1991; Chetcuti & Griffiths 2002; Coatsworth, 2005; Erikson, 1968; French & Seidman, 2006). This research will seek to demonstrate if a short-term after school program can improve elementary ELLs' self-esteem and sense of belonging within the school community. Another result of this study may be a compilation of researched-based activities to assist teachers in planning activities that will ultimately help ELLs develop their self-esteem. One premise underlying the research is that being some of the very few minority students within the school district, ELLs may feel isolated and as if they do not truly belong within their school. This could impact their self-esteem negatively and hence their academic achievement.

Chapter Summary

In this introduction I have explained how this research project came to be. I have explained the setting in which I work and the English language proficiency levels of the students I teach. This study strives to answer these questions: Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for one and a half hours a week for eight weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students are successful in promoting students' academic self-esteem? Finally, what activities do the students perceive as the most beneficial? In Chapter two, I will conduct a literature review of research about identity, self-esteem and language learning, and information about self-esteem and academic achievement. In the third chapter I will explain what methods were used to collect and analyze data. The results of

the study will be in Chapter four. In Chapter five, the final chapter, I will discuss the pitfalls and successes of this project. I will also include recommendations for research-based activities that worked positively with ELLs in a suburban/rural community.

CHAPTER TWO-LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

As stated in the introduction, the purpose of this study was to gain insight into what impact, if any, an after school program for mainstreamed elementary ELLs had on the participants' self-esteem and what kind of activities ELLs would benefit from in after school activities. The specific questions I sought to answer were:

- 1) Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem?
- 2) What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students seem to be successful in promoting students' self-esteem?
- 3) What activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to them personally?

While investigating the development of healthy self-esteem in students it became clear that identity formation and self-esteem are interrelated to such a strong degree that this study would not be complete without a mention of the leading theories in identity formation coupled with theories of the development of positive self-esteem. Below you will find information about identity, self-esteem, and belonging.

This chapter is a review of research about topics critical to this research. I will present the definitions of specific terms used throughout the study. The literature reviewed includes research completed in identity, self-esteem, self-esteem and academic learning, and curriculum. This review also includes a section where various methods used in teaching English language learners are explored. The goal of this portion of the

literature review is to discover a research-based pedagogy for working with second language learners during the study.

Identity, Self-Esteem and Belonging

Before beginning the following discussion, definitions of certain terms used throughout this report must be established for the reader to correctly understand the research. I will discuss the definition of identity, self-esteem and belonging as they are used throughout this study.

Identity

Historically, identity theories have followed the belief that a sense of self-identity is developed in a series of developmental stages. Erickson (1968) theorizes that there are developmental stages (infancy, early childhood, childhood, school age and adolescence) that all children move through at the same age. It is by going through these steps and navigating through their corresponding crises that a person's identity is formed. Self-identity emerges from experiences in which the temporarily confused self within is successfully integrated into a set of roles that secure social recognition. Still other researchers support the view of an ever-changing identity that does not necessarily happen in a linear or stage-like manner. (Peirce, 1989; Toohey, 1998; Connor, Poyrazli, Ferrier-Wreder & Grahame, 2004) Identity formation is considered a critical task of childhood and adolescence as children mature into adulthood. It is beyond the scope of this paper to discuss the various definitions and theories about identity formation. Suffice it to say that this is one area that remains highly debated in the psychological community. For the purposes of this research, identity will be defined as an ever-changing view of

self in relationship to others within various situations where cultural and power relations are at play (Hawkins, 2005).

Self-esteem

There is as much debate in professional literature about how to define *self-esteem* as there is in defining the concept of *identity*. Rosenberg (1979) defines self-esteem as the extent to which a person thinks positively about oneself. Self-esteem can also be defined by how much value people place on themselves. It is more perception than reality (Baumeister 2003). Khanlou (2004) defines self-esteem as the self-evaluative aspect of the self-concept, which is one's self-worth. Again it is beyond the scope of this paper to explore the definitions and concepts about the various definitions of self-esteem debated in professional circles. Therefore, for the purposes of this research, Rosenberg's definition will be adopted. Self-esteem is the extent to which a person thinks positively about oneself (Rosenburg, 1979). In this study we ask the question, "Does the link between the students' view of themselves as participants in the ELL club, where there is a high level of acceptance for language and cultural differences, translate into an improved self-esteem and improved academic performance?"

Belonging

For our purposes belonging is defined simply as a sense of mutual love and acceptance in a group (Chetcuti & Griffiths, 2002). The student with a sense of belonging is accepted as a person who has a rightful place within the classroom or community. Chetcuti & Griffiths (2002) and Erwin (2004) expand that definition of belonging by explaining that a person who belongs does not need to pass informal, unstated tests of

English fluency or social competence. They do not need to have the right clothes, accent or parentage. Thus, a sense of belonging or not belonging can be intricately involved in a student's self-esteem by how positively or negatively they view their acceptance into groups within which they regularly interact.

Language Learning, Identity, and Self-Esteem

Amidst research by social theorists, there can be found studies about the connection between language learning, identity and self-esteem. In the following discussion, I have extrapolated data from studies pertaining to adolescents that may pertain to all ages of learners and I have also attained information from those studies specifically related to elementary learners. While much of the information available regarding adolescents and self-esteem does not appear to be applicable to elementary students, I have consciously chosen to include some studies that I believe do apply to younger students. Coatsworth, (2005), Hamachek, (1995), Li-Rong, (2004), Jacobs, Vernon & Eccles, (2004), and Phinney, (1989), all conducted research that includes components that are applicable to elementary students. I have done this specifically because there is so little pertinent research done at the elementary level. This project is an attempt to help fill the gap about elementary ELLs, language learning and their developing self-esteem.

Hawkins (2005) concludes that socio-cultural theorists have illustrated deep connections between identity and language learning. She asserts that ELLs must be recognized and acknowledged by their discourse community as a competent learner to be fully accepted within the classroom community. Willet (1995) found that the acquisition

of language along with how children interact in the classroom as ELLs is an extremely complex task. English speaking teachers and peers have an ease with spoken English that is not present for ELLs. The concentration and effort that ELLs take to translate and to comprehend English for the full school day is often discounted when considering classroom interactions. Active listening requires a great deal more attention and skill for an ELL than for a native born speaker of English.

ELLs take on different activities to be accepted (to belong) within the classroom community and to be seen as competent even though English is not their first language. For example, frequently ELLs work together when given the choice to pick partners. This becomes part of their classroom identity. Also, speaking hesitantly or quietly may lead to the ELLs being chosen less when in groups to be the designated group “reporter” when doing cooperative activities. Thus, participation in certain activities becomes a part of the student’s classroom identity and may impact the student’s sense of belonging in the classroom community.

Toohy (1998) also found that the classroom community and its structures could negatively impact an ELL’s identity formation by limiting discourse patterns within the classroom environment. A process of community stratification happens throughout the school year that leads to the exclusion of some students from particular activities and practices. She maintains that by virtue of their language needs, ELLs are inadvertently excluded from the forms of discourse and classroom activities where they interact with other native English-speaking children. They frequently are seated near the teacher where their discourse tends to be with an adult model versus a child model. They are also

frequently pulled out to attend ESL classes and other support services where once again the interlocutor tends to be an adult versus a child or other children. She concludes that bilingual children are marginalized through actions that are the norm in many classrooms such as being seated by the teacher and being clustered together, as well as rules against mimicking another child's answer, and copying a classmate's written work. ELLs often repeat other children's verbal responses in oral interactions or look at classmates' written work to better understand what is happening in their environment. This behavior is frowned upon in most classrooms and forbidden in others. I understand this to mean that being marginalized in the classroom negates any sense of true belonging for a child and can have a negative impact on the child's self-esteem.

Within the school community and outside of the school community, Chetcuti & Griffiths (1993) and Umana-Taylor (2004) found that students self-esteem is impacted by the social groups of which they are a part, and that the identity of learners is inherently linked to the learners' group affiliations related to their ethnicity, culture, and family expectations. Heller (1987) also supports social theorists by maintaining that it is through language that a person negotiates a sense of self across various settings at various times. It is through language interaction that a person gains or is denied access to powerful social networks that give learners the opportunity to speak.

In summary, social theorists contend that students, identities are impacted by their interaction with individuals and groups around them. ELLs must learn to navigate the spoken and unspoken rules of verbal communication with native speakers of English. How well students do this impacts their acceptance and sense of belonging to the group.

If students are not able to bridge these gaps students' self-esteem is diminished and the students' identities are impacted by the lack of acceptance.

Academics and Self-Esteem

To review, let us remember that the stated purpose of this study is to gain insight into what impact, if any, an after school program for mainstreamed elementary ELLs has on the participants' self-esteem and what kind of activities ELLs would benefit from in after school activities. A review of the research results shows that there is overwhelming evidence that there is a significant positive correlation between positive self-esteem and academic performance (Dugger & Dugger 1998; Davies & Brember, 1999; Daniel & King 1997; Marsh, 1990). The specific questions in my research include: Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students are successful in promoting students' self-esteem? What activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to them personally?

Assumptions underlying these questions are:

- a. Strategically promoting an increase in self-esteem among ELLs is a good and desired outcome.
- b. Academic success is correlated to a positive self-esteem.
- c. Curriculum choices can positively or negatively impact students' self-esteem through their perception of personal school successes and failures.
- d. Students can determine what activities benefited them and what activities did not benefit them.

Research about the causal relationship between positive self-esteem and academic achievement does not support that having positive self-esteem actually causes academic success, but that the two often go hand in hand (Baumeister et al, 2003; Maruyama, Rubin & Kingsbury, 1981; Bachman & O'Malley, 1986). Bachman & O'Malley (1977) actually found that self-esteem is a result of positive academic achievement rather than seeing academic achievement as a result of a positive self-esteem. This on-going debate about which comes first, the positive self-esteem or the positive academic performance, continues to this date and is beyond the scope of this paper.

Since research indicates there is a positive correlation between positive self-esteem and academic achievement, I decided to implement some form of club to help meet the students' need for a place where they could develop friendships and a sense of belonging separate from the classroom environment. Providing a place where ELLs could experience challenging, academically sound, fun activities and succeed without language stress has been shown to help increase a student's self-esteem (Steitz & Owen, 1992).

Research of Project Curriculum Components.

The following research supports the development of a curriculum specifically designed to promote positive self-esteem in elementary ELLs. I hypothesize that elementary ELLs often tire of negotiating their language environment and withdraw from full participation in activities they might otherwise enjoy. Feeling overwhelmed with the burden of the language tasks, some students feel a sense of isolation and loneliness in the midst of their classmates and thus, their self-esteem and sense of belonging decline.

Hence, when developing activities for the after school club, the researcher incorporated activities supported by various researchers as esteem building activities.

McLean (2005) used specific activities with adolescents, including storytelling and the development of life histories. McLean's theory was that narrative meaning making activities could promote a students' self-esteem. Whereas, McLean's adolescents prepared autobiographical stories to create meaning from their life history, elementary students in this research project were given cameras and took pictures and then they told their family stories to other students by sharing the photographs.

Stiler & Allen (2006) collected both quantitative and qualitative data when they assessed the implementation of an in-depth African-American history unit at a local community center. Here students of African-American descent participated in activities that included culturally specific storytelling, music and multimedia art. The students recreated African and African-American artifacts. Cooperative learning activities where students worked in small groups were utilized throughout the program. Parent volunteers were key to providing stories and assistance with art projects.

Everyone involved with this program reported high levels of enjoyment and learning. Pre-tests and post-tests about the chosen topic (Martin Luther King and the Civil Rights Movement) showed that a program with culturally appropriate curriculum and immersion in a topic led the students to better academic understanding of the topic studied. Anecdotal evidence supported the idea that students, self-esteem was positively affected by the program (Stiler & Allen, 2006). This research study will adopt cooperative learning as the key methodology used during the after school club, hands-on

learning experiences will be offered and parent volunteers will be included based on this research.

In another study (Low & Wong, 1998), Hmong students were allowed to attend a class taught to them by a Hmong intern. The class was a history class of the Hmong people. Here activities were based on Hmong culture and beliefs explicitly tying in home experiences with school experiences. Extended family members were contacted and invited to participate in leading activities and presenting information. All activities were built around the concept of cooperative learning and student-centered, project-based learning. This study found that Hmong students involved in the research behaved differently when the class was led based on these ideas. Students raised their hand more often, fully raised their arms, engaged the instructor verbally, engaged in higher order discussions more frequently and smiled more often when in this class. The students reported a greater comfort level and felt they could fully participate in all aspects of the learning situation. Again this research supports the idea that curriculum can impact a students' self-esteem.

Hvitfeldt (1982), as quoted in Vang (2005), supports the need for cooperative learning activities that are student-focused. He found that achievement as the result of cooperative group activity is very much in line with Hmong social life outside the classroom. Hmong families carry out many routine activities such as gardening, shopping, or car repair in small groups versus individually. Grundman (2007) found that ELLs increased their level of involvement in learning activities that were structured in a

cooperative learning manner. Students were observed throughout the study on behaviors that included being on-task, contributing ideas, helping classmates and asking for help.

Delgas-Pelish (2006) completed a study with elementary children that showed that a child's involvement in extracurricular activities has been correlated to an increase in the child's self-esteem. This study lends support to the theory that an increase in a child's activities, responsibilities, and accomplishments help increase self-esteem. Leary (1995) found that friendships can foster an increase in self-esteem. Having a best friend to confide in or having a group of friends can help students achieve the feeling of belonging. This was especially true for elementary girls (Delgas-Pelish, 2006). This project purposefully brought together ELLs of Asian descent in a school where the vast majority of students were of European descent in an attempt to support the development of friendships.

Summary of Curriculum Research

In this study, I proposed to raise ELLs' self-esteem by providing a safe, friendly and engaging environment where friendships and a sense of belonging could be built. The activities and the structure of the proposed program were taken from a variety of research data (McLean, 2005; Delgas-Pelish, 2006; Low & Wong, 1998; Vang, 2005; Stiler & Allen, 2006). Cooperative learning activities were strongly supported by the research (McLean, 2005; Grundman, 2002; Nunan, 1992; Toohey, 1998). Thus many of the planned activities were based on cooperative learning practices. This project is an attempt to fill gap in research regarding elementary ELLs, language learning, and self-esteem.

The curriculum for the ELL club included fun learning activities that engaged the students in cooperative, self-directed, learning activities. The planned activities included developing a family tree, taking pictures of people and places important to the student, and writing about these activities. Plans also included offerings that supported classroom learning goals by constructing non-threatening ways for the students to interact through literacy-based fun. The plan was to introduce students to storytelling as a way to interact with literature and their families. The plans incorporated teaching the students explicit skills such as using appropriate volume, developing props, and using expressive voice skills when telling a story or reading a story. These activities and plans were all based upon the research presented in this literature review.

Chapter Summary

In Chapter Two I have set forth research in the following areas: self-esteem and identity formation, identity and language learning, self-esteem and belonging and the relationship between a positive self-esteem and positive academic achievement. I have also included a handful of studies that support a pedagogy for working successfully with ELLs to increase their sense of identity and self-esteem. Cooperative learning, self-directed activities, storytelling, projects incorporating an understanding of the students' cultures, and in-depth topic studies prevailed across the curriculum ideas recommended for working with ELLs. Research also supported providing an atmosphere where friendships could grow and an environment safe for personal exploration was deemed

critical. The plan also included allowing the curriculum to be responsive to the students' interests as the club unfolded.

In Chapter Three, I will provide specific details about the participants in this study, the activities included in the project, and the methodologies used to collect data over the course of the research project.

CHAPTER THREE-METHODOLOGY

Introduction

In the last section, I explored what research has shown in relation to language learning and identity, self-esteem, belonging, and academic achievement. Research has shown that a higher self-esteem and academic achievement are significantly and positively, correlated although causality has not been clearly determined. (Daniel & King, 2005; Marsh, Payne, & Shavelson, 1988; Davies & Pember, 1999). Different curriculum models were researched to identify activities that have been found to be successful in promoting a student's self-esteem and academic achievement. Here, I describe the parameters of this study: setting, participants, English language proficiency levels of students, and attendance. I explain what methods were used to collect participant data, how data collection was done and why each type of data was included in the study.

Methodology

Research methods in education are most often based in the behavioral and social sciences, relying heavily on sociology, psychology, and anthropology. These fields tend to use quantitative (number-based data collection) and experiential research methods (Best & Kahn, 1998). Thus, much educational research is also done with these methodologies.

Action research is defined as systematic enquiry conducted by teachers in real classroom situations about how to take specific steps to improve their own teaching. It is not like traditional research since the teacher is the researcher, hence does not have the

outsider perspective traditional educational researchers maintain (McNiff, 1988; Bogdan & Biklen, 1992). Action research data can be either qualitative (descriptive without the use of numerical data) or a combination of qualitative and quantitative data (Best & Kahn, 1998, Nunan, 1992). I decided to use action research to investigate the impact an after school program had on ELLs self-esteem. I also researched curriculum choices to enhance self-esteem and elementary ELLs preferences for learning activities.

The specific activities chosen were based on the program models used by Stiler & Allen (2006) and Low & Wang (2005). These programs utilized the development of cultural awareness for the students via cooperative learning experiences. They incorporated the cultural beliefs and values of the students and their families into the curriculum. Parents, teachers and outside speakers were welcomed to share their cultural experiences and to teach the students about aspects of culture that the students may not have thought about.

Storytelling was used as a teaching tool to inspire the children's interest in literature and their own life stories. Narrative meaning-making and memory activities such as those done by McLean (2005) were used to promote students' opportunities for identity development. The activities planned included the opportunity for the students to develop a personal scrapbook, the opportunity to record information about their ancestors' life stories, to make cultural artifacts, to learn about various cultures and to build skills in telling stories. Storytelling activities included making props to use as a storyteller. Parents and other adults representing Hmong, Cambodian, and Indian cultures were invited to the club to share their experiences although only one parent was able to

present. The presenters were invited to read or tell a story from their childhood. The plan was that the parent volunteers would also lead craft activities that represent cultural artifacts. This idea was based on the work by Stiler & Allen (2006). The program leader in their study had invited members of the African-American community to participate in an after-school program to help students get a deeper understanding of the contributions African-Americans have made in the United States. According to Stiler & Allen (2006), students enjoyed making artifacts such as masks, necklaces, dwelling, and quilts. (see Appendix B)

During the after school club, careful attention was paid to providing a place free from judgments about English language use and academic abilities. We openly discussed that mistakes made while in club would stay in club and we would not make fun of people for trying new things. Each week there were a variety of activities available for students to be do. All of the activities were structured to allow students the opportunities to choose which activity to engage in and to allow the students to work individually or as part of a group.

Setting and Participants

The program presented was an after school club restricted to ELLs. The school was a K-5 elementary school located in a suburb of the St. Paul/Minneapolis area of Minnesota. The residents of this area are primarily of European heritage with a growing ethnically diverse population. One premise underlying the research was that ELLs felt isolated and as if they did not truly belong within their school since there were so few

ELLs in the school. This could impact their self-esteem negatively and hence their academic achievement.

The after school club ran for eight weeks in April and May of the 2007/2008 school year. The club was held in the school library. Participation in the after school club was voluntary. ELLs in kindergarten through fifth grade were invited to participate in the club. Parental permission to attend the club and to participate in the research was mandatory. Student activities were literacy-based (to provide a classroom learning connection) and research-based. The fifth grade participant was given the opportunity to step into a leadership role by leading game activities and functioning as the teacher's assistant.

Seventeen students were given parental approval to attend the after-school club. Fourteen were given permission to participate in the research. There were five first-graders, two second-graders, four third-graders, two fourth-graders and a fifth grade student who participated in the actual research. The students included nine girls and five boys.

Data Collection

In the last section, I provided information regarding the setting for this research, the participants, and the underlying pedagogy used to determine which activities to present. I explained that the research model most closely aligned with this research is action research. Below I describe for you the data collection methods used during this research.

- a. A revised Rosenberg Self-esteem Scale (RSE) was use before and after completion of the club. (See Appendix C and Appendix D)

- b. Notes collected weekly by the researcher.
- c. Compilation of observations by adult volunteers at the end of the club.
- d. Weekly student questionnaire. (Appendix E)
- e. Classroom teacher behavior questionnaires from before and after the completion of the club. (Table 3.2)
- f. Videotaped club activities.

The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale

The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale has withstood the test of time for as a valid and reliable test of global self-esteem when used with adults. The RSE is a 10-item Likert-type scale. A Likert-type scale is a form of questionnaire that has subjects respond to a set of pre-determined questions. The responses range from strongly agrees to strongly disagree. The Likert-type instrument assigns a scale value to each of the five responses from 1- 5 (Best & Kahn, 1998). Research examining the reliability of the RSE scale generally has reported this tool to be a sound psychometric tool with internal reliability standards being met consistently over time and with various samples as reported in Connor, Payrazli, Ferrer-Wreder and Grahame, (2004).

The Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale-A Pilot

A pilot using the proposed revised RSE was done at an elementary school within the same school district that served approximately the same number of ELLs as the school where the club was held. Native English speakers were included in the trial to help ascertain if the questions were too difficult for fully proficient students of this age and grade.

The scale used in this study was reworded so the questions were understandable for lower English proficiency elementary students. The response choices were also limited to four choices: strongly agree, agree, disagree, or strongly disagree (1, 2, 3, 4). This form was used with kindergarten through fifth grade students. (see Appendix C).

This pilot indicated that the majority of students in second grade and below did not understand the questions. (Table 3.1) The negatively stated questions were especially difficult for these students. For example one of the questions that proved the most incomprehensible to the students was: “Most of the time, I feel a little bit like I am a failure”. Students in lower elementary were puzzled by this question and the majority had to have it explained to them by explaining it in a positive way. This defeated the purpose of having a mix of positively and negatively worded statements inherent to the reliability of the original RSE.

It was interesting to note that two of the native English-speaking first graders also did not comprehend the double negatives used on the revised version of the RSE. This indicated to me that this may be a language development issue. Students at this grade level appear to still be learning the meanings of negatively stated questions even as native speakers. Thus, an even simpler format was developed to use with kindergarten through second grade ELLs that used the yes or no responses to simplified questions. (see Appendix D).

Table 3.1

Results of Student Comprehension of the Pilot Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale

Identity #	Grade	LEP	Native Language	Students understood terms agree & disagree	Students who needed verbal clarification of questions because they did not understand the double negative sentence structure.
1	K	NS	English	yes	
2	K	2	ASL	no	X
3	1	4	Hmong	yes	X
4	1	3	Hmong	no	X
5	1	NS	English	yes	X
6	1	NS	English	yes	
7	2	3	Spanish	yes	X
8	2	3	Spanish	yes	X
9	2	5	Hmong	yes	
10	2	NS	English	yes	X
11	3	3	Spanish	yes	X
12	4	5	Hmong	yes	
13	4	6	Hmong	yes	
14	5	5	Hmong	yes	
15	5	5	Spanish	yes	
16	5	4	Hmong	yes	X
17	5	NS	English	yes	

The Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale Used
With The Students Attending The After School Club

The pilot showed further revision was needed for the participants of this study. Thus, further revisions were made to the self-esteem inventory used. Each third through fifth grade student was given a revised version of the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale (RSE) prior to the first meeting of the club (Rosenburg 1965). After the pilot the RSE was reworded so the questions were understandable for lower English proficiency elementary students. The terms used in each sentence were reviewed and simplified

terminology replaced vocabulary terms thought to be too difficult for the students to understand. The response choices were also limited to four choices-strongly agree, agree, disagree, or strongly disagree rather than five choices as in the original RSE. The revised RSE was also given verbally to all of the students rather than in written form. The ESL teacher or assistant met individually with each student and recorded the student's answers.

Ultimately, kindergarten, first and second grade students were given a ten-question survey simplified to yes or no answers.(see Appendix D). This format was developed after performing the trial of the revised RSE data collection form explained above.

Observations

The researcher kept written observational records after each meeting with the students in the ELL club. These records focused on the level of student participation (one to one, small group, played alone), perceived enjoyment of activities, and student comments. These observations were made in an attempt to demonstrate changing student self-esteem by indicating positive behavior changes over the course of the study. Adult volunteers, three licensed regular education teachers and an educational assistant also provided the researcher with a summary of their observations at the conclusion of the club. These observations by volunteers were overview statements about the group response to club activities. A few volunteers' added comments regarding specific changes they noted in individual students over the eight weeks we met.

Another form of data collected was the student questionnaire. The student questionnaire became one of the most critical components of the research. This questionnaire gave the students an opportunity to express their opinions on the activities completed on a weekly basis. As the students became more engaged in the activities, the entire course of the curriculum altered, although it remained true to supporting the research done prior to implementation regarding curriculum. (see Appendix E) This feedback mechanism allowed the curriculum to shift to meet the needs and interests of the students over the course of the club.

Another form of data collected was a questionnaire based on the work done by Low & Wong (1998) that was given to the students' classroom teachers prior to the start of the club and then again at the conclusion of the club. The majority of the questions were taken straight from the questionnaire used by Low & Wong (1998). Low & Wong tracked these behaviors as indicators of self-esteem in college students. This tool asked classroom teachers to respond to 11 questions regarding specific student classroom behaviors. A copy of the questionnaire is included in Appendix F. This is a closed-form of questionnaire (Best & Kahn, 1998). The reason it was chosen was that it was quick and easy to fill in, it kept the teacher focused on specific behaviors and it could be tabulated fairly easily. The behaviors tracked are indicators of positive or negative self-esteem. This questionnaire was used to help ascertain if there was any positive effect on student classroom behaviors after attending the after school club.

An additional piece of data was collected primarily for school record-keeping requirements. Attendance was taken at the beginning of club every week. This allowed

me to track student interest through attendance or lack thereof throughout the weeks the club was held.

Finally, club activities were videotaped. The goal of videotaping club activities was to note if there were any new and different behaviors in the students indicating a more positive sense of belonging as the club met. It was also done to provide a more objective view of student interaction during the club since I was so involved in the club activities with the students. The intention was to videotape the first week, the fourth week, and the final week. In the end, only the final meeting of the club was actually videotaped. In the next chapter about research results and discussion this will be more thoroughly explained.

Chapter Summary

The questions I hoped to answer through this research were the following: How does attending an after school club impact ELLs' self-esteem? What activities are successful in promoting ELLs' self-esteem? And what activities do the students view as the most beneficial? Various measures were used to collect data in an attempt to get a well-rounded view of what happened with the students during the times spent together in club and to see what, impact if any, this time had on classroom behaviors and/or the students' self-esteem. Curriculum activities were researched and developed with the intention that the activities lend support to achieving academic classroom literacy goals, developing a positive self-esteem and developing a sense of belonging within the students.

In the Chapter Four the results and findings of the data collection will be presented in detail. Following that, a discussion of the findings of this research will be presented along with some curriculum recommendations for teachers to use with ELLs in after school clubs.

CHAPTER FOUR-RESULTS

Introduction

In chapter three, the methods used to collect data before, during, and after the conclusion of the club were presented. Readers were presented with the data collection tools utilized throughout the after school club. In Chapter Four the results of the data collected will be shared and then discussed. To review for the reader, the purpose of this study was to gain insight into what impact, if any, an after school program for mainstreamed elementary ELLs had on the participants' self-esteem and what kind of activities ELLs would benefit from in after school activities. The specific questions I sought to answer were do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students seem to be successful in promoting students' self-esteem? And finally, what activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to them personally?

Chapter four is organized into sections that follow the same outline as information provided in chapter three. The sections are broken down as follows: results of the Revised RSE Data Collection, observations by researcher and volunteers, summary of observations of group interaction, summary of observations of individual interactions, the importance of parent involvement, results of the student questionnaire, results of the classroom teacher questionnaires, data collected from the videotape, discussion of results related to self-esteem, discussion of results related to curriculum; storytelling and readers

theater, craft activities, discussion of the results of implementing research-based curriculum, and final discussions.

Results of the Revised RSE Data Collection

The intent of the researcher when using the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale was to provide a revised version that could be used effectively with elementary ELLs to determine if attending the after school club positively impacted the students' self-esteem. The RSE has a long history of being modified and adapted to many different situations (Rosenburg, 1979).

In Chapter three the need for two revised versions of the RSE was explained. The revisions for the K-2 students were so extensive there is little to relate it back to the original RSE. An overall review of the data collected, however, was still of interest to the researcher.

Prior to the club each student was given a revised (RSE) scale. (see Appendices C and D) This questionnaire was 10 questions long. This questionnaire was then given to the students again at the end of the eight-week ELL club. Each question on the questionnaire was awarded ten points. If a student chose the response that indicated a positive self-esteem, they were awarded ten points for that question. If they chose the answer that corresponded with a negative self-esteem, they were awarded five points for that question. The following table 4.1 indicates the scores before and after the club.

Table 4.1

Scores on the Revised RSE Pre and Post Club

Participant	Scores on Pre-Club	Scores on Post-Club
1.	65	70
2.	75	75
3.	75	75
4.	75	80
5.	75	80
6.	80	80
7.	80	80
8.	80	80
9.	85	85
10.	85	90
11.	90	90
12.	90	90
13.	90	95
14.	95	100

The range of scores prior to the club was 65 – 95 points. The range of scores after completion of the club was 70 – 100 points indicating an overall shift towards more positive self-esteem for the entire group. The average of the students' scores also increased from 81.43 to 83.57 after attending the club. A summary of the differences or changes in the scale scores indicates that there was minor movement in some of the students' self-esteem scores. Eight students' scores remained the same after the club. Six students' records show a five-point scale increase from the first to the second score. How significant a change this indicates is truly unknown since the modifications to the original RSE scale were so intensive.

Observations by Researcher and Volunteers

The researcher took notes each week at the conclusion of the club. During the club it was not possible due to the total involvement of the researcher with the students

while teaching and managing the activities. The intention of the researcher was to focus on the level of student participation (one to one, small group, played alone). The researcher also wanted to note which activities the students appeared to enjoy the most to enable a curriculum responsive to the students' needs.

After reviewing the notes, a number of patterns of interaction came to light. They can be grouped into two main groups: group interactions and individual interactions.

Observations of Group Interaction

The group was composed of students from six different grade levels. This strongly impacted the students' interactions with each other. Students from the same grade level tended to stick together for the entire club experience. The first time we met this was the most evident. The one fifth grade student stood back from the group and when asked to sit down so we could begin, she chose to sit by the fourth grade students. The one kindergarten boy also sat slightly separated from the other students and chose to sit within a foot from the researcher. The majority of the first graders sat next to each other in a semi-circle. Behind them the two second and two third grade students aligned themselves by grade next to each other leaving the fourth and fifth grade students towards the back of the group. One first grade student sat down behind a whiteboard on a tripod and had to be asked to move to the front of the tripod.

The description above is what happened during what came to be called "story time." It was the beginning time of the club meeting and "story time" happened weekly. It included taking attendance, playing a group game and an adult reading a story to the students.

The student interaction pattern changed slightly over the course of the club. By week three the K-2 students were mingling together while the third through fifth grade students aligned themselves together as well. This became the pattern for the remaining five weeks of the club. What was interesting to note is that the pattern of interaction among the students stayed relatively the same whether the students were involved with story time or sitting at tables working on craft projects. It became evident that the attention spans and the interest levels varied quite noticeably along this division of K-2 and 3-5 students.

Another group interaction pattern that developed related to gender. Boys stayed with boys and girls stayed with girls. This sample was really too small to know if this would be the case with a larger number of students. Out of 17 students attending the club, (14 research participants) only five were boys. They were all in K-2 that may have also impacted their desire to be together. There was one exception to this situation when one of the boys was very interested in presenting a flannel board story to a group. He, along with two girls, ultimately practiced and presented a poem using the flannel board to a large group. It is interesting to note that this was the one activity that crossed the gender grouping and the grade grouping interactions. Three students chose to present poems with flannel boards. Two were girls and one was a boy. One student was in first grade, one in second, and one was in third grade.

Observations of Individual Interactions

The first behavior noted when reviewing individual observations was that at different times throughout the course of the club the majority of students would choose to

do independent work separate from the group. The safe, comfortable environment in which the club was held enabled this behavior. The club was held in the school library that was big, light and comfortably decorated with sitting rugs, tables, and chairs. It was a well-known space to all of the students. This behavior of separating from the group came in different forms. A few students regularly left the group to do individual coloring or craft activities at the craft tables when no other students were at those tables. Another handful of students would often choose to go off into a reading nook and read independently. Yet, others routinely sat alone at a table to do their craft activity. It was noted, too, that these separations typically lasted only five to ten minutes. The students were still very much a part of the activity happening throughout the library space but appeared to need some quiet, independent time. I hypothesize this independent time was used by the students in two different ways.

First, I think the majority of the students used this time as a break from engaging in learning. This club happened right after school and sometimes the fatigue of a long day may have impacted a student's need for a bit of alone time. The students all interacted in English and again this could have caused a need for a break from social interaction.

The second way I think students may have used this independent work time was as a way to regain a sense of self when working through identity issues. One student in particular demonstrated this identity work in action. He was a first grade student raised with Hmong and English in the home. According to his mother, English was the primary language used at home and by the student. Yet, in this school with very few minority students, he was referenced as Hmong on a daily basis. Initially this student did not

interact with any of the other students. He only interacted with the researcher or other adult volunteers. It wasn't until week three that he began slowly to interact with the other ELLs in the group. He also started sharing with the researcher things about his Hmong identity at home that were different from things at school such as foods and family traditions. By the sixth week, this student was fully engaged with the group in all club activities. He would still occasionally step aside to color or "take a break" but he would quickly rejoin the group or others would come and ask him to join in one activity or the other. This student went from barely speaking at all to being a narrator of a Readers Theater presentation at the end of the club.

A second student, the only student with Cambodian heritage in the group, was observed doing almost the identical behaviors. He, too, was in first grade. He, too, according to his parents, spoke primarily English at home. This boy separated himself from the other students on a weekly basis. The separate activities usually lasted ten minutes or less. He, too, interacted heavily with the researcher and adult volunteers. As time passed he interacted more readily with other members of the group.

Finally, there was a third grade Hmong girl, who also acted in a very similar manner. She rarely spoke to any one and only interacted with another third grade girl for the first four or so meetings of the club. Initially, she did not look at any of the adults when interacting with them. By the end of the club, she was asking questions of the adult volunteers and fully participating in a Readers Theater production. She had eye contact with the adults most of the time when interacting. She also had decreased her alone time dramatically by the end of the fourth meeting of the club.

Another behavior change noted by the researcher and volunteers was that some of the students slowly took on leadership roles within the group structure. The fifth grade student was encouraged to take a leadership role. She actively planned and led group games for two or three of the gatherings and she accepted a key role in organizing and directing a readers' theater presentation the third through fifth graders developed over the course of the club. She became noticeably more comfortable projecting her voice in an appropriate volume for group settings and encouraging others to do the same.

A first grade student also took the leadership role in developing a short puppet show about friends. She led two other first grade girls in coming up with lines and actions to accompany the movement of the animals. The teacher typed up the words of the play for the children and they used their own words in the script for their final presentation.

The Importance of Parent Involvement

One of the most powerful influences on the entire eight weeks of the club was the presentation of a fable by one of the student's mothers. Originally, the plan was to invite three guest storytellers from the parent group to come and share with the students. Three parents of Hmong students were asked and unable to help out due to the conflict between the time of the club and the workday. The Cambodian mother had said she would like to be a part of the club, but ultimately her work schedule also precluded her coming to the club. Thus, this one mother of Indian descent was our only parent storyteller. The impact she had on the students was remarkable. This woman attended the club on week three. Up until that time, the students had been primarily involved in drawing and crafting

puppets to use in storytelling. They had been introduced to the idea of using a flannel board, had played some group games and had listened to a number of fairy tales. They had shown a lot of interest in the fairy tales and engaged in predicting, finding text to self connections, text to world connections and questioning (Harvey & Goudvis, 2000) However, the students did not appear to understand how to engage in telling a story whether from a poem, book or fairytale. Modeling by volunteers and the researcher did not seem to have an impact on the students' interest in being storytellers versus listeners to stories.

All of that changed after the mother told an Indian fable from memory. She spoke with a noticeable accent, made a few English grammar errors and was also new to storytelling. She took her time and answered the students' questions as the story was told. At the end of the story, she explained the meaning of the fable to the students when they were not able to generate the meaning on their own.

This became a defining moment within the club and the research. When this woman had concluded her presentation, the researcher was able to explain to the children that her desire was for them to learn how to tell stories and fables just like this mom. The researcher told them she hoped that by the end of the club each of these students could feel confident enough to go home and tell stories, poems or fables to their family members or friends. The students' interest and passion was ignited after seeing another ELL--a mother--tell a story. They were excited and immediately engaged fully in the storytelling activities that prior to this event had not garnered much interest. Four of the older girls immediately went to explore using flannel boards to tell stories. They

explored all of the stories available with ready-to-use felt pieces and spent 45 minutes learning how to tell stories using the flannel board. They practiced individually and then together in pairs. Three first grade girls decided to create their own story to tell. They worked together with some stuffed animals as puppets and created a two or three minute show about friends helping friends. The younger boys all worked with an adult volunteer to read and perform The Three Little Pigs as a Readers Theater presentation. It became clear only one of the boys had the necessary reading skills, so he became the narrator. The others memorized their lines through practice over the next couple of weeks. The fourth and fifth grade students moved to the fairy tale of Hansel and Gretel (Lesser, 1996). They began to memorize the words so they could use the puppets they had made to create a puppet show. Ultimately, this activity also became a Readers Theater project. Shepard (2004) defines Readers Theater as a framework for dramatic presentation that does not require a stage, props, or memorization. Participants openly read from scripts while performing.

This week became a turning point in the curriculum for the club. The students had chosen a path that lead to Readers Theater activities and that would be the direction the club continued until ultimately the kids decided to put on a performance for their parents the last night of club to showcase all they were learning and doing.

Other notes showed that the students enjoyed the club time. Four of the students' classroom teachers commented on how excited the kids were on the day of their club. Three parents also commented on how the students looked forward all week to attending club and frequently talked about club activities at home. The volunteers who helped with

the club all commented on how happy the students were while at club and how much they looked forward to coming to club every week.

Results of the Weekly Student Questionnaires

Each week at the conclusion of our get-together, the students were asked two questions before leaving. “What was your favorite activity tonight?” and “Which activity did you learn the most from?” The choices the students were given for each question were being with friends; listening to stories; group time (large group games); or the craft activities. The following table 4.2 shows totals chosen per item over the course of the eight weeks.

Table 4.2

Results of Weekly Student Questionnaires

What was your favorite activity tonight?	Totals	Which activity did you learn the most from tonight?	Totals
Being with friends	33	Being with friends	8
Listening to stories	12	Listening to stories	40
Group time	9	Group time	22
Craft Activities	44	Craft Activities	23

The day after the last club get-together, the students were also asked to identify their overall favorite activities and which activities they felt they learned the most from during the eight times we met. This time the responses were student generated. Results are shown in table 4.3.

Table 4.3

Results of Final Student Questionnaire About Overall Favorite Activities and What Activities Students Believed They Learned the Most From Doing.

Overall Favorite Activities	# of Students	Activities Where I Learned the Most	# of Students
Performing for Parents	5	Performing for Parents	8
Using a Camera	2	Using a Camera	2
Using Flannel Boards	1	Using Flannel Boards	1
Group Games	1	Group Games	1
Making Puppets & Coloring	3	Making Puppets & Coloring	
Doing the Scrapbook	2	Doing the Scrapbook	
Listening to Stories	0	Listening to Stories	1
Being with Friends	0	Being with Friends	1

By simply examining the table detailing weekly responses in table 4.2, it is not possible to discern the meaning behind some of the data. A key piece that is missing is that when the students chose "Listening to the Story" as their favorite activity for the night, almost half of those 40 votes occurred on the evening that the storyteller was one of the students' parents. The total of 33 votes for being with friends may be a result of a special event--the first warm days of spring in Wisconsin. Many of the votes for this choice happened the two days we went outside to play on the playground for the last 15 minutes of club time. The younger students were very happy to be outside and not confined to indoor activities. The older students also enjoyed being outside, but it did not appear to impact their responses to the questions as it did for the younger students.

One thing that does become clear when looking at the data is that the favorite activities did not necessarily align with the activities the students felt they learned the most from doing. The favorite activity chosen routinely on a weekly basis was being with friends. This supports the data that sense of belonging and having friendships is a key component of self-esteem (Delgas-Pelish, 2006; Leary, 2005). However, that the students

clearly felt their learning came from a different source than through being with their friends. The weekly activities the students reported that they learned the most from were listening to the story and making the craft projects. Through observation it was clear to the researcher and other adults that even this report could be broken down further by grade levels. The kindergarten through second graders overwhelmingly chose the craft activities as where they learned the most.

Results of the Classroom Teacher Questionnaires

The pre and post questionnaires completed by the students' classroom teachers were compared to determine if each student had improved in a specifically listed behavior, had decreased the behavior, or had remained the same according to teacher observations. An analysis of the classroom teacher responses about student in-class behaviors does show some change in students behavior from before and after the club.

Table 4.4

Results of Classroom Teacher Questionnaires

Questions Asked Classroom Teachers pre and post club N=14	# improved	# decreased	# unchanged
1. Interacts with classmates socially	4	1	9
2. Interacts appropriately with peers in small groups.	2	2	8 (2 not reported)
3. Fully raises arm/hand in class.	5	1	8
4. Partially raises arm/hand in class.	8	1	5
5. Looks at you when speaking to you.	6	1	7
6. Looks at you when you speak to him.	2	3	7 (2 not reported)
7. Speaks at appropriate volume in class.	3	3	8
8. Speaks at appropriate volume when 1:1	2	3	9
9. Volunteers to help others in classroom.	3	2	9
10. Students view student as leader.	4	1	9
11. Teacher views student as leader.	2	0	12

The greatest change noted from the beginning of the club to the end of the club was that the students raised their hands fully in class. This indicates more confidence in their abilities. The number of students partially raising their hand also increased and may indicate a willingness to risk answering questions or participating more assertively in class. Another area of change, considered positive, was that more students made eye contact when speaking with their classroom teachers (Low & Wong, 2006). Positive change was also noted in student behaviors when interacting appropriately with peers. Minor positive change was also found in the area of peer leadership. Two teachers did comment that while their students fully raised their hand more often now, they continued to only partially raise their hands in math. The fact that the students were more tentative in math class leads to the question of why? What is it about math that caused these students to continue to be hesitant when raising their arms?

Overall, the classroom teachers each commented that the student/s in their room appeared to be happier since attending club and always looked forward to attending the club. One or two teachers mentioned that their student appears to have a better attention span now than prior to the club. Two noted that they had observed friendships develop among children in the club out on the playground.

Data Collected from Videotape

It was the intention of the researcher to videotape the first club meeting, the fourth club meeting and the final club meeting. Due to varying circumstances and last minute problems with equipment only the final night of the club was actually videotaped. This video shows the Parent Night presentation that the students performed for their parents

and siblings. I was looking for new or different behaviors, students' responses to their parents presence, and indicators of differences in student behavior between the first night of club to the last night of club for comparison purposes.

Details and observations drawn from the video shows:

1. Three of the students who originally were the three quietest students ultimately became narrators for their parts in the performance.

2. Three students asked if they could perform a Hmong dance as part of the performance. They performed two Hmong dances dressed in ceremonial clothing. These

These girls took the initiative to bring their own costumes, CD player, and music for the presentation.

3. The third, fourth, and fifth graders performed a Readers Theater production of Hansel and Gretel (Lesser, 1996). They practiced both during club and time and outside of club time. They created costumes and props to use with the performance. They all helped decide how to “act” during the performance.

4. Three of the first grade girls performed the puppet show they had created. The teacher typed up their words and the students performed the show in the manner of a Readers Theater presentation.

5. The five boys performed a memorized version of the Three Little Pigs (Galdone, 1984). One of the boys acted as narrator, one as the wolf, and three as the pigs.

6. Three children chose to do a rhyme with accompanying flannel board pieces.

The children were very anxious to perform well. The kindergarten boy told the researcher he had to throw up. This demonstrated to the researcher how much doing these

activities were out of his comfort zone. Others were pacing and repeatedly questioning the researcher if their parents were coming to the performance. Two children asked to phone home to remind their parents about the performance. This demonstrated how important it was to the students to have their parents attend the event and acknowledge their learning.

The video also showed that most of the student performers still had a hard time looking up at their audience even after the coaching that had happened during practices. They also had a hard time maintaining the volume needed during a group performance.

Overall, the video depicted students who had all stepped out of their comfort zones. The majority of these students would not have gotten this type of experience in the classroom since classrooms have so many students. Here the students tried out parts and roles to play that they would not be comfortable doing in front of their non-ELL peers.

Discussion of Results Related to Self-Esteem

The purpose of this formal study was to answer these questions: 1) Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? 2) What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students are successful in promoting students' self-esteem? 3) What activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to themselves personally?

As stated earlier in this research, there is much debate in academic circles about the definition of self-esteem. For this research the definition used was that self-esteem is the extent to which a person thinks positively about oneself (Rosenburg, 1979).

In this research a sense of belonging was considered an inherent component of self-esteem.

The attempt to revise the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale and use it with elementary ELLs met with limited success. The kindergarten through second grade students found the questions difficult to comprehend even when reduced to yes and no questions. The third through fifth grade students appeared to have better success understanding the revised RSE than did the younger students. One unstated element within the testing was the students' English language proficiencies (ELP). It was noted that the students struggling the most to comprehend either format of the revised RSE were the students who when assessed on their ELP were at levels one and two, which meant they had significantly fewer English skills than did the other students who scored in the three, four, and five levels of the ELP scale.

The results, even with their limitations did show a shift in overall self-esteem of the group as a whole during the time the after school club was held. This is a very short amount of time for any assessment to indicate a change in self-esteem, so any conclusions must be made with great hesitancy. Taking that into consideration and combining the data collected all together I believe this research shows that ELLs in a district where they are in a great minority do respond positively to being together in an after school club (Stiler & Allen, 2006; Vang 2005). Observations made by the adults and teachers present also indicate that some students appeared to develop a deeper sense of belonging from the beginning of the club to the end of the club. Students who were quiet and withdrawn at the beginning of the club were actively participating and enjoying

activities by the end of the club. Students were also stepping forward into roles they had never tried before within the club environment (Low & Wong, 2005). This changed behavior indicates an increased self-esteem to me as the researcher.

Discussion of Results Related to Curriculum

Storytelling & Readers Theater

The curriculum planned for the club changed drastically after the third week of the club. This was done to incorporate the students' intense desire to put together a performance for their parents. The students voted unanimously, in a secret ballot vote, to spend the last evening of the club entertaining and performing for their parents. This performance became the driving force behind the students' motivation to do well with their chosen parts in the performance. Activities that were laid aside in order to accommodate this change of course included developing a family tree, writing family stories and doing oral interviews with relatives. There was also only one parent storyteller involved with the club. This person had a tremendous impact on the students and made the importance of involving parents with any after school club very apparent to the adults working with the children (Stiler & Allen, 2006; Low & Wong, 2005; Vang, 2005).

The students responded with great interest to fairy tales that are traditionally taught to lower elementary school native English speakers. These fairy tales, often presented when ELLs have very limited English skills and do not understand them very well held great interest across the grades as we read them together and talked about the texts and illustrations (Delgas-Pelish, 2006). In this club, the pace was slower than in the traditional classroom and students appeared more willing to ask about the text than they

do typically in their classrooms (Harvey & Goudvis, 2000). Fourth and fifth grade students were reintroduced to stories they had heard before but apparently with limited understanding. The K-2 students responded very positively to singing songs related to the texts we were examining (Peregoy & Boyle, 2005). This appeared to help them get a deeper understanding of the text. These positive responses to storytelling-based activities definitely support the research upon which they were based (McLean, 2005, Low & Wong, 1998, Stiler & Allen, 2006). During the club, the Readers Theater model of teaching literacy skills emerged and was extremely motivating to these ELLs. I would recommend that all ESL teachers and mainstream teachers working with ELLs find a way to incorporate the Readers Theater model into their literacy classrooms. It not only incorporates the development of reading and writing skills but also the oral language skills and the listening skills that ELLs work (frequently unsupported by the school) to develop on a daily basis. As a person untrained in the Readers Theater model I was a very surprised by this development. Thankfully, one of the volunteer teachers had extensive knowledge of this methodology and was able to provide the coaching and mentoring needed for the club activities to succeed as well as they did.

Cooperative learning activities were very successful with these learners. Not only were they comfortable interacting with each other while they worked, but various students developed their leadership abilities within different groups (Lightbrown & Spada, 1999; McLean, 2005). One first grader became the group reader because his reading skills were a bit more advanced than the other students with whom he was reading. One student became involved in producing the parent performance and

contacted people about props and scheduling rehearsals. Another student lead the way when bringing in cultural artifacts and pictures from home to share while the students worked on their crafts. Yet another student, who initially did not interact much with the group, made new friends during craft activities that extended to the classroom as reported by his classroom teacher.

Craft Activities

The students all loved having time to do crafts. A number of the volunteers who assisted the students mentioned that their perception was that the students would have been happy if the only thing we did every week was crafting and art projects. This was particularly true with the K-2 students. These students loved the freedom to explore with their craft activities and the freedom to not do an activity if they did not want to do it (Erwin, 2004). The fact that they had the choice and that there was no grading to be done seemed to free them to explore. Erwin (2004) and Peregoy & Boyle (2005) contend that students who have a choice of hands-on activities often develop a positive sense of self-esteem as they successfully complete self-determined activities. The students in this after school club created many art projects that they were very proud of, often racing to their parents to show them at the end of the club. The students from all grades enjoyed making props that they used in the final performance for their parents and families.

Originally, the plan was to incorporate more craft activities from the Hmong, Cambodian and Indian cultures. This did not happen primarily because we ran out of time and because of the limited parent involvement in the weekly club sessions. The move

into the Readers Theater arena and putting together a performance for parents also precluded more of these culturally specific activities from happening.

The students did respond very positively to being given disposable cameras to take home and use. Each student was to take pictures of people, things and places important to them. The photos were developed and put in individual writing journal/scrapbooks. The students wrote about the pictures and told stories about the pictures (Peregoy & Boyle, 2005). This activity was cut short due to time restrictions and the students went home with pictures and a minimum of writing in their journals. They were, however, very proud of the journals they produced.

There were two problems that were encountered with this activity that teachers should be aware of if interested in doing a joint camera and writing activity. The primary one was getting the cameras back in a timely fashion from the students. Some of the students returned their cameras late and therefore their pictures were not developed for the first night we worked on the journals. One student never returned her camera so her journal was void of pictures. The second problem was one of time. This activity takes much more time than had been allotted for this group to work on it. The third through fifth grade students were highly motivated and easily could have spent two or three entire club meetings working on these journals.

Summary of the Results of Implementing Research-based Curriculum

The activities successfully done during this club attest to the research upon which they were based. Cooperative learning definitely is successful with ELLs (Peregoy & Boyle, 2000). Storytelling and learning how to be a storyteller was a powerful way of

engaging the students. The narrative meaning-making activities such as developing personal stories, documenting of their life history etc. also were also powerful tools (McLean, 2005). One of the most powerful motivators mentioned in both Low & Wong (1998) and again in Stiler & Allen (2006) was the presence and inclusion of parents in the classroom (club). The involvement of the students' parents in this club, though not as much as was desired by the researcher, was critical to its success.

One method of instruction I had not found information about when researching successful curriculum to use with ELLs was the Readers Theater model of instruction. This does not mean there is not research available, only that this researcher did not access it. The ELL students truly self-selected this method of learning more about the stories presented to them. They enjoyed learning how to project their voices, how to get into a character, and how to play to an audience. They were very motivated to perform well for their parents and family members.

Overall, this study fully supports a curriculum using content-based, cooperative learning activities that are culturally sensitive (McLean, 2005, Grundman 2002; Nunan 1992; Toohey, 1998). In addition, if the learning environment is structured so it is self-directed, includes meaning-filled activities for the learners, is fun and incorporates parents as participants, it will be an even better learning opportunity for ELLs (McLean, 2005; Stiler & Allen 2006).

Chapter Four Final Discussion

There was little change in the student classroom behaviors surveyed by the classroom teachers before and after the student attended the club that suggested any

statistically reliable data. The questionnaires filled out by classroom teachers indicated that the students did appear to have more confidence in raising their hands in class, with the exception of in math class. Some teachers changed their view of their ELL student from never being seen as a leader in the classroom to sometimes being seen as a leader in the classroom. The small number of participants impacted the usefulness of this survey.

The student questionnaires, both the one done weekly and the one done at the culmination of the club, provided us with some interesting results. The data showed that the students really enjoyed being together with other ELLs in an after school program. It also showed that they thought they learned best from listening to stories, from doing craft projects and performing for their parents. Students indicated very strongly that they learned the most when their parents were involved.

The one time the club was videotaped was enough to gather comparative data between the researcher's memory of the differences between the first meeting of the club and the final meeting of the club. These comparisons can best be presented in chart form.

Table 4.5

Comparison of Observations from the First ELL Club Meeting to the Last ELL Club Meeting.

First ELL Club Meeting	Last ELL Club Meeting
Extremely quiet.	Noisy.
Little interaction between friends.	Old friends and new friends working together.
Neutral facial expressions.	Smiling, nervous laughter.
One or two students separated from group by self-choice.	All students together. No one off on their own.
Looked uncertain, fearful.	Looked proud of accomplishments.

The students were very proud of their performance on the final evening. Those students who objectively did not perform well still felt they did perform well and were proud that they tried to do something new. The students' parents and other guests were very proud of the students in the club. Each student had at least one parent present and at least three of the parents took time off of work to come to the final performance. This was very meaningful to the students.

One final piece of data collected over the course of the club by the researcher for student management purposes adds to our discussion of results. Every week I took attendance. If good attendance is indicative of a positive learning experience, then the ELL club was very successful providing a positive learning experience. The club was held eight consecutive weeks after school. Seventeen students regularly attended the club. Over the entire eight weeks, only four students missed one club meeting each. Two of those students were not participants in the research study but elected to attend club meetings. So out of the total of fourteen research participants, two students missed one meeting time each. This means twelve participants attended all eight meetings. The two participants who missed a club session were both ill with the stomach flu on the days they did not attend. This high attendance rate certainly indicates an overall positive response to club activities and curriculum.

In this chapter, I presented the methods used for data collection throughout this action research project. I included results from the collection of self-esteem inventories information about the curriculum used and the curriculum researched. I also discussed the results of classroom teacher and student questionnaires. I shared the observations of

student behaviors collected by the volunteers as well as myself throughout the course of the ELL club.

In the chapter five I will discuss the results and what they mean for classroom teachers, ELL teachers and other interested readers. I will draw some conclusions based on the research and implementation of the after school club. I will also discuss the limitations of this research and suggest some areas for further research.

CHAPTER FIVE-CONCLUSION

Reflections and Conclusions on the Research

The purpose of this study was to answer these questions: 1) Do ELLs who attend an after school ESL club for 1 ½ hours a week for 8 weeks show a noticeable improvement in their self-esteem? 2) What curriculum-related activities in an after school program for ESL students are successful in promoting students' self-esteem? 3) What activities did the students perceive as the most beneficial to themselves personally?

The ELL club was very successful according to parents, students and volunteers. They all felt it was an important endeavor and worthy of continuing during the next school year. Parents reported that the students felt more connected to their school and happier to come to school on days that club was held. These spontaneous comments and requests for the club to continue the next year from parents and students, combined with the high attendance rate, showed the researcher that there is indeed the need for an after school ELL club at this school. The positive response from the family and students indicated to this researcher that an increased sense of belonging and meeting the need to be with friends who understand the daily language struggles at school did happen over the course of the eight weeks of the ELL club. Thus, I contend that the students overall did feel an increase in their self-esteem as indicated by feeling a sense of belonging to the club. Whether this sense of belonging positively impacted the students' classroom participation or performance could not be determined through this short-term project. Two classroom teachers verbally reported that one of their students attending the club

had starting showing significant gains during the last 12 weeks of school (which correlates with the timing of the club). There were too many factors involved to isolate attending the club or a raise in self-esteem and a sense of belonging as causal factors for these academic gains.

The ELLs who participated clearly liked attending the club. They were enthusiastic and often asked about club activities on days that the club did not meet. The ability to participate in activities that were self-chosen (within some teacher-imposed limits) was a key to the success of the program. Purposefully allowing the curriculum to follow the learners rather than having the learners follow a pre-set curriculum impacted the direction of the activities. It is important to note that the students' choice that led to a performance for their parents using the Readers Theater model of learning followed a path supported by the research done before the club curriculum was designed. All of the activities involved cooperative learning with their peers, content-based literacy learning and hands-on learning activities. The activities included choices to express individuality while still operating within a group environment and creating personally meaningful outcomes.

The attempt to involve parents did not meet the desired expectations during this research project. The time of the club made it very difficult to access parents as resources and the limited number of community contacts made this a weakness in the overall program. I would put much greater effort into involving parents and other adult community members in a club were I to coordinate an after school program for ELLs in the future. The impact the parents' involvement had with these elementary learners cannot

be stated strongly enough. It is one of the strongest pieces of learning that happened for me as I did this research. I have known the importance of involving parents for many years. This research project took what I know to be an important component of teaching ELLs and moved it into what I now understand to be a critical and urgent need for elementary ELLs. They need to have their parents involved more than I ever recognized prior to this research. Something I cannot define or explain happened between these kids and their parents when brought together during club time. I can only guess what need was filled for these kids when they listened to the one mom tell a fable and when their parents came to the final club; perhaps it was need for validation, acceptance or encouragement.

In summary, the major conclusions of this researcher are that:

1. An after school club for elementary ELLs can help them in developing a sense of belonging to the school community.
2. Research-based curriculum is critical for successfully engaging and motivating participation with ELLs.
3. Elementary ELLs enjoy being brought together for fun and learning opportunities after school.
4. An effective grouping of ELLs for after school activities could consist of K-2 and 3-5. By working individually, with a partner, or in small groups kindergarten through second grade ELLs can have many of their needs for a sense of belonging and acceptance met by working on craft and coloring activities in an environment where it is safe to make mistakes.

The older elementary students responded to literature-based activities that could help them in the classroom and were fun to do. They preferred activities that related back to the classroom rather than activities just "for fun." They enjoyed coordinating ideas and activities, planning and implementing a plan. They treasured critical input from teachers and coaches who offered them specific critiques of their work with kindness and in a non-threatening manner.

5. Parent participation in after school clubs should be viewed as a critical component of any after school program for ELLs not as an optional component.

6. A small number of students per adult is important in making the club activities successful. There were five adults present at the majority of these club meetings. That means there was approximately a 1:3 ratio of adults to students. This appears especially important with the kindergarten through second grade levels.

Research Limitations.

The RSE was the most structured form of data collected during this study; however, the revisions necessary to use the RSE with the students limited how much weight should be placed on the results garnered from the survey. Some of the research participants still appeared to have difficulty fully understanding the revised questions although a trial was done prior to the research with a comparative group of ELLs. As researcher I particularly question the results obtained with the kindergarten through second grade group, as they had the hardest time understanding the questions.

Other limitations of this study include the number of participants in the study. This study had a very small group of participants. There were also many other uncontrolled

variables that could have impacted the documented changes: a new friend, a new seating arrangement in class, or the subjective nature of the observations. It is also very difficult to measure a change in self-esteem in only eight weeks.

A further limitation was the short amount of time this club lasted. Perhaps extending the research throughout an entire year would provide greater insight into student behavior changes, classroom connections and the question of the impact self-esteem has on learning.

Recommendations for Further Research

I would recommend further research into the wants and needs of elementary ELLs. This project allowed the students a voice in what they chose to do and they had the opportunity to voice their perceptions on how they learn the best. Many assumptions are made about ELLs based on research completed with native English speakers. I suspect the learning needs of elementary ELLs may fall outside of the typical needs list for native English speakers. Just as I came to a new understanding of the need to include parents in programming, there may be other critical, rather than optional, components missing in the current provision of educational services for young ELLs. The impact of being an ELL in a school that is primarily native English speakers and the need to develop a sense of belonging is another area that further research that would benefit elementary ELLs. There is research about self-esteem and older students, but there is still a noticeable gap in understanding the self-esteem needs of children in elementary schools who speak English as a second language. Exploring other ways to more accurately measure self-esteem with elementary ELLs is another area where more research would be helpful. I would

recommend research based more strongly on the connection between curriculum and specific positive student behavior change be done with elementary ELLs. Readers Theater techniques and their impact on learning for ELLs is another area of research that might indicate an untapped curriculum model for reaching marginalized ELLs.

Conclusion

This research project showed that parents and teachers of elementary ELLs noted a positive difference in their students' sense of belonging to the school community when attending an after school program for ELLs. No causal relationship between attending the group and improvement in classroom behaviors or self-esteem could be definitively ascertained. The positive correlation between higher self-esteem and academic accomplishment could not be positively supported through this data but qualitative evidence shows the correlation exists.

This research project also found support for the research completed by Grundman, (2002), Low & Wong, (1998), McLean, (2005) and Stiler & Allen, (2006) indicating that teachers who provide a curriculum based on cooperative learning techniques, cultural sensitivities and in-depth content will provide a successful learning experience for their students. Readers Theater was discovered to be a teaching method that was very motivating to this group of elementary ELLs.

Qualitative data collected also showed that elementary ELL students responded the most positively to activities promoted by their parents or other ELLs' parents. The younger students primarily enjoyed being with friends. ELLs enjoyed working together on craft activities and "hanging out" together while doing some crafts. The older

elementary students enjoyed specific learning activities that would help them perform better in the classroom.

For me, this research took best practices and methods for instruction, information about improving self-esteem in students and an understanding of the importance of a sense of belonging to children's self-esteem from the intuitive to the concrete. Documenting behavior changes helped me see clearly the impact of friendships and a sense of belonging on learning. This affirmation of the need to include affective learning components in education has further informed my practice as an educator and helped me improve my understanding of how to best teach ELLs. I hope that my experience is an encouragement to other educators in this era when affective considerations in the profession of teaching are often being set aside due to high pressure academic schedules. Children need a sense of belonging and a strong sense of self to navigate through their school years. Their academic achievement will be enhanced and accelerated by engaging in learning activities that help them build their self-esteem and feel proud of their life experiences.

APPENDIX A

English Language Proficiency Levels

English Language Proficiency Levels

The definitions of the five limited-English language proficiency levels, as well as Level 6, one of two fully-English language proficiency levels, are from PI 13.08(3)(1)-(6), Wisconsin Administrative Rule. Level 7, the other fully-English language proficiency level, is used for purposes of state reporting/state testing.

Level 1—Beginning/Preproduction [WIDA level = Entering]:

A pupil shall be classified level 1 if the pupil does not understand or speak English with the exception of a few isolated words or expressions.

Level 2—Beginning/Production [WIDA level = Beginning]:

A pupil shall be classified level 2 if all of the following criteria are met:

- (a) The pupil understands and speaks conversational and academic English with hesitancy and difficulty.
- (b) The pupil understands parts of lessons and simple directions.
- (c) The pupil is at a pre-emergent or emergent level of reading and writing in English, significantly below grade level.

Level 3—Intermediate [WIDA level = Developing]:

A pupil shall be classified level 3 if all of the following criteria are met:

- (a) The pupil understands and speaks conversational and academic English with decreasing hesitancy and difficulty.
- (b) The pupil is post-emergent, developing reading comprehension and writing skills in English.

(c) The pupil's English literacy skills allow the student to demonstrate academic knowledge in content areas with assistance.

Level 4—Advanced Intermediate [WIDA level = Expanding]:

A pupil shall be classified level 4 if all of the following criteria are met:

(a) The pupil understands and speaks conversational English without apparent difficulty, but understands and speaks academic English with some hesitancy.

(b) The pupil continues to acquire reading and writing skills in content areas needed to achieve grade level expectations with assistance.

Level 5—Advanced [WIDA level = Bridging]:

A pupil shall be classified level 5 if all of the following criteria are met:

(a) The pupil understands and speaks conversational and academic English well.

(b) The pupil is near proficient in reading, writing, and content area skills needed to meet grade level expectations.

(c) The pupil requires occasional support.

Level 6—Formerly Limited-English Proficient/Now Fully-English Proficient:

A pupil shall be classified level 6 if all of the following criteria are met:

(a) The pupil was formerly limited-English proficient and is now fully English proficient.

(b) The pupil reads, writes, speaks and comprehends English within academic classroom settings.

Level 7—Fully-English Proficient/Never Limited-English Proficient:

The student was never classified as limited-English proficient and does not fit the definition of a limited-English proficient student outlined in either state or federal law.

APPENDIX B

Curriculum Information

Weekly ELL Club Curriculum Information

Long Term Goals:

*To increase elementary ELLs self-esteem by providing a place to develop a sense of belonging, academic successes, and social interaction in their home school.

*To increase the students' sense of self by exploring their family history and culture through storytelling and story writing.

Short Term Goals:

*To provide a link to school literacy instruction by increasing ELLs interest in reading and writing.

*To provide cultural learning experiences for ELLs.

*To increase opportunities for ELLs to interact and form friendships with each other.

Materials Needed:

Flannel Boards: I created 5 small flannel boards by purchasing small bulletin boards and covering them with flannel.

Flannel Board characters-homemade or store bought. I borrowed many of these from the school library.

Scrap booking supplies and materials.

Scrapbooks-enough that each student can have one.

Disposable cameras-enough for one or two students to share. I had family members share cameras.

Basic art supplies: construction paper, pencils, markers, colored pencils, glue sticks, popsicle sticks or straws, crayons, scissors.

Books: Those needed for the storytellers and books for the students to use.

What Actually Happened During the After School ELL Club

Week 1	Greetings Snack/Story time Teacher models flannel board stories	Students paired for story planning Each pair picks one story to learn and to retell the group using a flannel board.	<u>Little Red Riding Hood</u> , <u>The Emperor's Pot</u> , <u>The Three Little Pigs</u> , <u>Round as a Mooncake</u> , <u>Fiesta</u> , <u>The Snowy Day</u>	Group Game led by oldest student.
Week 2	Greetings & Group Game led by the oldest student.	4:15 Snack/Storytime Guest Teacher models using flannel board to tell a story.	<u>I Know An Old Lady Who Swallowed a Fly</u> . Students taught the corresponding song to go with the flannel board story.	Students taught the corresponding song to go with the flannel board story. Students made puppets depicting the story.
Week 3	Greetings Snack/Story time Teacher models reading, <u>Hansel and Gretel</u> .	Students begin puppets to be used with <u>Hansel and Gretel</u> .	Activities: Finish making puppets. Tell stories with flannel boards; create their own puppet show using teacher's animals.	Played outside due to the first, wonderful, spring day.
Week 4	Greetings & Snack	Story time: <u>Little Red Riding Hood</u>	Students practice telling flannel board stories, finish puppets and spontaneously begin to act out and perform skits and stories.	Students receive disposable cameras to take home.
Week 5	Greetings & Group Game	Students share their puppet stories with the other groups.	Students all practice their performances of <u>Hansel and Gretel</u> , <u>The Three Little Pigs</u> , and more.	Some cameras returned. Students continued to work on finishing puppets.
Week 6	Greetings & Group Game	3-5 Student reads a story using new skills to younger students.	Students continue to develop storytelling skills and practice for their performances.	Younger students play outside. Spring in Wisconsin!
Week 7	Greetings & Group Game	Using pictures the students had taken, students put together their scrapbooks.	Students put together their family story and scrapbooks.	Students practice their stories in preparation for parents' night.
Week 8	Greetings	Students practiced stories, set up area for guests and greeted parents upon arrival.	The students presented a 30-minute program for their parents and teachers.	Ice cream sundaes and cookies were served.

APPENDIX C

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, Grades 3-5

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale 3-5

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale for Elementary Students 3-5

(Revised by Marilyn Gleason, February 2008)

SA = Strongly Agree, A = Agree, D = Disagree, SD = Strongly Disagree

- | | | | | |
|--|----|---|---|----|
| (1) Overall, I am happy with myself. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (2) Sometimes, I think I am no good at all. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (3) I feel that I have some good things about me. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (4) I am able to do things as well as other kids. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (5) I feel I do not have much to be happy with about myself. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (6) Sometimes, I really feel I can't do anything right. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (7) I feel that I'm as important as any other kid. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (8) I wish I could respect myself more. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (9) Most of the time, I feel a little bit like I am a failure. | SA | A | D | SD |
| (10) I have good feelings about myself. | SA | A | D | SD |

Name of student: _____

Name of scale administrator: _____

Date: _____

*Based on the original Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale in Rosenberg, M. (1965). *Society and the Adolescent Self-Image*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

APPENDIX D

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale K-2

Revised Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale

(for Elementary Students K-2)

(Revised by Marilyn Gleason, March 2008)

1. I like myself. Yes or No
2. Sometimes, I think I am no good at all. Yes or No
3. I feel there are some good things about me. Yes or No
4. I am able to do things as well as other kids. Yes or No
5. Sometimes I don't like myself. Yes or No
6. Sometimes, I feel like I can't do anything right. Yes or No
7. I feel that I'm as important as any other kid. Yes or No
8. I wish I could respect myself more. Yes or No
9. Usually, I feel like I am a nobody. Yes or No
10. I have good feelings about myself. Yes or No

APPENDIX E

Weekly Student Questionnaire

Weekly Student Questionnaire

Which activity was your favorite activity today?

Student	Friends	Listening to Story	Story Group Project Time	Visitor	Craft	Comments absent/misc.
a						
b						
c						
d						
e						
f						
g						
h						
i						
j	nonparticipant					
k						
l						
m						
n						

APPENDIX F

Classroom Teacher Questionnaire

Classroom Teacher Questionnaire

Student Behavior A Please check the most appropriate response with regards to _____	Never	Rarely	Sometimes	Always	Comments
Interacts with classmates socially.					
Interacts appropriately with classmates in small groups.					
Fully raises arm/hand in class					
Partially raises arm/hand in class					
Looks at you when speaking to you					
Looks at you when you speak with him/her in class					
Speaks at appropriate volume in the classroom setting.					
Speaks at appropriate volume in one to one interactions.					
Volunteers to help others in the classroom					
Students view this student as a leader.					
Teachers view this student as a leader.					

REFERENCES

- Bachman, J. G. & O'Malley, P. M. (1977). Self-esteem in young men: A longitudinal analysis of the impact of educational and occupational attainment, *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 35, 365-380.
- Bachman, J. G. & O'Malley, P.M. (1986). Self-concept, self-esteem, and educational experiences: The frogpond revisited (again). *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 50, 33-46.
- Baumeister, R. F., Campbell, J.D., Krueger, J.I., & Vohs, K.D. (2003). Does high self-esteem cause better performance, interpersonal success, happiness, or healthier lifestyles? [Electronic Version], *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, Vol. 4(No.1), 1-42.
- Best, J. W., & Kahn, J. V. (1998). Methods and tools in research. In *Research in education*. (Eighth ed., pp. 275-332). Boston: Allyn & Bacon. (Original work published 1959).
- Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (1992). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theory and methods* (2nd ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon. (Original work published 1982).
- Chavira, V., & Phinney, J. S. (1991). Adolescent's ethnic identity, self-esteem, and strategies for dealing with ethnicity and minority students [Electronic version]. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences*, Vol. 13(No. 2), 226-7.
- Chetcuti, D., & Griffiths, M. (2002). The implications for student self-esteem of ordinary differences in schools: The cases of Malta and England [Electronic version]. *British Educational Research Journal*, 28(4), 529-549.
- Coatsworth, J. D., Sharp, E. H., Palen, L.-A., Darling, N., Cumsille, P., & Marta, E. (2005). Exploring adolescent self-defining leisure activities and identity experiences across three countries [Electronic version]. *The International Society for the Study of Behavioral Development*, 29(5), 361--370.
- Dagenais, D., Day, E., & Toohey, K. (2006). A multilingual child's literacy practices and contrasting identities in the figured worlds of French immersion classrooms [Electronic version]. *The international journal of bilingual education and bilingualism*, Vol. 9(No. 2), 205-14.

- Daniel, L., & King, D. (1997). Impact of inclusion education on academic achievement, student behavior and self-esteem, and parental attitudes. [Electronic Version]. *The Journal of Educational Research*, Vol. 91(No.2), 67-75.
- Davies, J. & Brember, I. (1999). Boys outperforming girls: An 8-year cross-sectional study of attainment and self-esteem in year 6. [Electronic Version]. *Educational Psychology*, Vol. 19(No.1), 5, 12.
- Day, E. M. (2002). *Identity and the young English language learner* (B. Colin & N. H. Hornberger, Eds.). Bilingual education and bilingualism. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters LTD.
- Dugger, J. and Dugger, C., (April, 1998). "An Evaluation of a Successful Alternative High School," *The High School Journal*, Wilmington, NC: University of North Carolina.
- Erikson, E. H. (1968). *Identity Youth and Crisis*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, Inc.
- Erwin, J. C. (2004). Planning a classroom of choice: The i-five approach. In *The classroom of choice: Giving students what they need and getting what you want* (pp. 194-198). Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Freeman, H. L. (1998). *Building community: Creating an effective learning environment*. Unpublished master's thesis, Hamline University, St. Paul, MN.
- French, S. E., Seidman, E., Allen, L., & Aber, J. L. (2006). The development of ethnic identity during adolescence [Electronic version]. *Developmental Psychology*, Vol. 42(No. 3), 1-10.
- Grundman, J. (2002). Cooperative learning in an English as a second language classroom. Unpublished master's thesis, Hamline University, St. Paul, MN.
- Hamachek, D. (1995). Self-concept and school achievement: Interaction dynamics and a tool for assessing the self-concept component [Electronic version]. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 73, 419-425.
- Harvey, S., & Goudvis A. (2000). *Strategies That Work*. Portland, Maine: Stenhouse Publishers.
- Hawkins, M. R. (2005). Becoming a student: Identity work and academic literacies in early schooling. [Electronic version]. *TESOL Quarterly*, 39(1), 59-82.

- Heller, M. (1987). The role of language in the formation of ethnic identity. In J.S. Phinney & M.J. Rotherman (Eds.), *Children's ethnic socialization: Pluralism and development* (pp. 180-200). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Hvitfeldt, C. (1982). Learning language and literacy: A microethnographic study of Hmong classroom behavior. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Wisconsin, Madison.
- Jacobs, J. E., Vernon, M. K., & Eccles, J. S. (2004). Relations between social self-perceptions, time use, and prosocial or problem behaviors during adolescence [Electronic version]. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 19(1), 45-62.
- Khanlou, N., R.N., Ph. D. (n.d.). Influences on adolescent self-esteem in multicultural canadian secondary schools [Electronic version]. *Public Health Nursing*, Vol. 21(No. 5), 404-11.
- Leary, M.A., Schreindorfer, L.S., & Haupt, A. L. (1995). The role of self-esteem in emotional and behavioral problems: Why is low self-esteem dysfunctional? *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, 14(32), 297-314.
- Lightbrown, P. & Spada, N. (1999). *How Language are Learned*, (2nd Ed). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Li-Rong, L. C. (2004). The challenge of hyphenated identity [Electronic version]. *Topics in Language Disorders*, 24(3), (216-219).
- Low, J. M., & Wong, P. L. (1998, Summer). Effects of a Hmong intern on Hmong students. *Multicultural Education*, 5(4). Retrieved July 18, 2007, from http://vnweb.hwwilsonweb.com/hww/results/results_single_ftPES.jhtml.
- Marsh, H.W. (1990). Causal ordering of academic self-concept and academic achievement: A multiwave longitudinal panel analysis. *Journal of Educational Psychology* Vol. 82 (No. 4), 646-656.
- Maruyama, G., Rubin, R. Al, & Kingsbury, G. G. (1981). Self-esteem and educational achievement: Independent constructs with a common cause? *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, Vol. 40, 962-975.
- McLean, K. C. (2005). Late adolescent identity development: Narrative meaning making and memory telling. [Electronic version]. *Developmental Psychology*, 41(4), 683-691.
- McNiff, J. (1988). *Action research: Principles and practice*. London: Macmillan Education..

- Nunan, D. (1992). *Research methods in language learning*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Peirce, B. N. (1989). Social identity, investment, and language learning. *TESOL Quarterly*, 29(1), 9-29.
- Phinney, J. S. (1989). Stages of ethnic identity development in minority group adolescents [Electronic version]. *Journal of Early Adolescence*, 9(1-2), 34-49.
- Rosenberg, M. (1965). *Society and the Adolescent Self-Image*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Rosenberg, M. (1979). *Conceiving the Self*. New York: Basic Books, Inc.
- Rossell, C. (2004/2005, December/January). Teaching English through English. *Educational Leadership*, 32-36, 32.
- Steitz, J. A., & Owens, T. P. (1992, Spring). School activities and work: Effects on adolescent self-esteem. [Electronic version]. *Adolescence*, 27, 37-50.
- Stiler, G., & Allen, L. (2006). Making connections with the past: (Un)masking African American history at a neighborhood community center [Electronic version]. *Multicultural Education*, 13(4), 24-281.
- Toohey, K. (1998). "Breaking them up, taking them away": ESL students in grade 1. *TESOL Quarterly*, 32(1), 61-83.
- Umana-Taylor, A. J., & Bamaca-Gomez, M. (2004). Developing the ethnic identity scale using eriksonian and social identity perspectives [Electronic version]. *Identity: An International Journal of Theory and Research*, 4(1), 9-38.
- U.S. Census Bureau: State & County Quickfacts-St. Croix County, Wisconsin, Accessed June 8, 2008 at <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/55/55109.html>.
- Vang, C. T. (2005, Fall). Hmong-American students still face multiple challenges in public schools. *Multicultural Education*, 27-37.
- Willett, J. (1995). Becoming first graders in an L2: An ethnographic study of L2 socialization. *TESOL Quarterly*, 29(3), 473-499.
- Wisconsin Department of Instruction (n.d.) English language proficiency levels. Retrieved August 19, 2008, from <http://www.dpi.state.wi.us/ell/pdf/elp-levels.pdf>